

**Minutes of the IFFO RS Limited Governing Body Committee held at  
St Pancras Renaissance Hotel London, Euston Road, NW1 2AR on Wednesday, 23 April 2018 at  
10.00 hrs.**

<b>Present:</b>	Andrew Jackson (Chair) Eduardo Goycoolea, IFFO Board/Producer Humberto Speziani, IFFO Board/Producer Ernesto Godelman, CeDePesca/ ENGO Duncan Leadbitter, Fish Matters/ Independent expert Blake Lee-Harwood, SFP/ ENGO Michiel Fransen, ASC/ Standard Holder Daniel Lee, GAA/ Standard Holder Niels Alstead, Biomar/ Feed producer Michael Lutz, Köster Marine Proteins/ Trader Estelle Brennan, Lyons Seafoods/ Fish processor Frank Trearty, Pelagia/ Producer Clarus Chu, WWF/ ENGO
<b>In attendance:</b>	Trygve Berg Lea Jill-Denisse Bohmfalk Francisco Aldon, IFFO RS Laura Shepherd, IFFO RS Mike Platt, RS Standards (sections 4, 5, 7 & 8) Libby Woodhatch
<b>Apologies:</b>	Neil Auchterlonie, IFFO Ally Dingwall, Sainsbury's/ retailer Andrew Mallison, IFFO
<b>Not present</b>	David Parker, Youngs/ fish procesor

### **1. APOLOGIES AND MATTERS ARISING**

The Chair opened the meeting and declared that a quorum was present.

He announced that Ally Dingwall would be leaving the Governing Body (GB) and that a possible replacement could be Aisla Jones (retailer) and asked for any further suggestions from the GB.

The Chair introduced Ernesto and Clarus as new members of the GB, and both provided the GB with an introduction and some background.

The Chair discussed matters arising and brought the IFFO RS Annual Report to the attention of the GB and asked for any suggestions for future versions.

### **2. MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 11 OCTOBER**

The minutes of the GB meeting held on October 2017 were approved.

### **3. ACTIONS**

It was confirmed that all outstanding actions from the October 2017 GB have all been completed and actions from previous meetings are either ongoing or completed, with nothing that remains 'outstanding'.

The only exception to this was the ongoing action to establish a sub-committee to clarify the terminology used throughout the supply chain for assessment and certification, which would be handed over to Libby Woodhatch as the new IFFO RS Executive Chair.

#### **4. IMPROVER PROGRAMME**

##### **Approved Acceptance procedures**

The Chair handed the discussion over to the Head of Operations, who updated the GB on the new Improver Programme Application Mechanism (IPAM) before taking questions.

The question was raised about the differences between a basic and a comprehensive FIP, to which the Head of Operations provided an explanation and confirmed that IFFO RS has aligned procedures with Fishery Progress, .

The question was raised about ensuring credibility (at what level), to which the Chair confirmed that even if a FIP appears on fisheryprogress.org website it does not automatically mean that IFFO RS recognises or accepts that FIP, this is what the IPAM had been established for.

Concern was raised that in some areas, IFFO RS has a higher bar to pass than the MSC and therefore some equivalence between IFFO RS and MSC indicators was needed. The Chair confirmed that a Benchmark with this regard has been conducted and would be discussed later in the meeting.

It was confirmed that if a FIP is accepted in to the IFFO RS IP, it will be listed on the IFFO RS website so companies can cross check the validity of their supplies.

The suggestion was put forward of a third option, with a listing on the Conservation Alliance for Seafood Solutions (CASS) website for a basic FIP, a comprehensive FIP and an IFFO RS IP FIP. However, this was identified as a challenge that may bring confusion and that a third element would be difficult to include. More information on this will be presented at the next GB meeting **ACTION**

The Chair proposed a Timeframe for approval of an assessor in addition to the requirements mentioned in the IP procedures. The Head of Operations confirmed that the entry procedures for IFFO RS IP assessors would be developed and the names of potential assessors will be ready for approval at the next GB meeting. **ACTION**

The Head of Operations asked the GB whether, as part of the approval process for IP assessors, they should be required to have completed a successful FAP in order to be considered as an approved assessor?

##### **Mixed Trawl Fisheries Assessment Criteria**

The Head of Operations presented the proposed timeline for the development of the Mixed Trawl Fishery Assessment Criteria to the GB, with the entry mechanism criteria finalised by October 2018.

The following key questions were put to the GB;

1. Is the GB happy for the assessment process to focus on Improver Programme fisheries in the short term (working towards a 2018 launch for the multispecies IP approach)? Running it as a pilot using the current knowledge we have in this area. Could we give recognition to those who are working along with the Pilot programme?
2. Is the GB happy for the development of a process by which multispecies fisheries can be approved against the IFFO RS requirements to occur in the longer term, with the estimated launch date of Oct 2019 as version 2.1?

Pros and cons were raised with regards to the development of the Mixed Trawl Fishery Assessment criteria. Concerns were raised about mixed trawl fisheries for reduction, as it is believed that the industry is attacked for using whole fish for reduction when whole fish for human consumption could be available in a poor country or community, and therefore to now allow mixed trawl fisheries would open further criticism and could harm IFFO RS' reputation.

Whilst this concern was taken on board, it was discussed that there are companies waiting on this procedure and it is getting to a critical stage. Delays have already been experienced and further delays should be avoided if possible. Scrutiny on how this is done is essential and good communication is required for understanding what recognition would mean for people being part of the Pilot and being Improver Programme accepted.

It was agreed that this area could not simply be ignored as the fisheries and use of mixed trawl species for reduction will continue regardless. The argument is that if we don't do it, there will eventually be no fish at all, not just no fish for fish meal. Moving irresponsible fisheries to responsible through the proposed improvement journey will result in more fish for human consumption, which will ultimately mean more fish meal from heads and carcasses. This is where a clear messaging is required on what IFFO RS is and the benefits of the programme.

The proposed pilots are a good way to check how the assessment criteria works, but needs to be conducted on a good geographical spread of different kinds of mixed trawl fisheries. An update on the progress of Applicants requesting acceptance into the Pilot Programme would be presented at the next GB in October 2018. It was agreed that between 2 – 5 pilot FIPs relevant to multispecies fisheries should be conducted for credible feedback (**ACTION**)

### **Programme Expansion**

The chair raised a point for discussion to the Governance Board and was to agree on the proposed strategy for the development and better support in South East Asia.

The chair asked the GB to consider

1. Partnering with others such as BAP, ASC and feed companies such as Cargill. All of them have expressed an interest in helping and possibly sharing services.
2. Raising money either directly or via a charity from major philanthropic funders for this outreach work.

The GB agreed that the avenues presented should be explored and it was suggested those that are interested in this expansion (ie feed companies such as Cargill or Thai Union etc) should be included to deliver this strategy more effectively.

### **Potential Applicant Update**

The Chair handed discussion over to the Head of Operations who provided an update for information on the

progress made in relation to the potential improvers programme in Ecuador and India.

## **5. IFFO RS GOVERNANCE**

### **Board/Committee Composition/Executive Chair**

MP was requested to step out during the discussion of the IFFO RS Governance and Finance.

The Chair provided an update on the composition of the GB. A replacement for Ally Dingwall is required and the GB was asked for further suggestions.

David Parker has changed jobs and is now working for an NGO, however, the NGO seats on the GB are fully allocated. However, with his knowledge and experience it was agreed he would be a useful member of the Committees within IFFO RS such as FPRC, IPAC or TAC as an Independent consultant. (ACTION)

Suggestions were made for Tracy Cambridge, now employed by Thai Union, to join the Governance Board. (ACTION)

The Chair confirmed with members of the GB that in UK law, it is IFFO RS Ltd that is the formal Board of IFFO RS, who then delegate the task of developing, revising and interpreting all standards to a Governing Body Committee. To ensure legal compliance moving forward, the IFFO RS Governance Board will now become the IFFO RS Governing Body (GB) Committee, with a new Terms of Reference (ToR) drawn up for this Committee. Articles of Association have also been up for IFFO RS Limited to ensure legal compliance

The chair asked if any of the GB members wish to also join the legal (limited) board, who are not direct IFFO representatives, to get in touch.

Feedback on the ToR and Articles of Association from GB members would be welcome. Copies can be sent to GB representative's lawyers if requested (ACTION)

The new IFFO RS GB Executive Chair will take over from Andy Jackson on May 1<sup>st</sup> 2018 and will also become a director of IFFO RS Limited.

## **6. FINANCES**

### **Finance: YE Accounts 2017**

The 2017-year end accounts were discussed and presented for approval. A profit of £5,000.00 was confirmed, which has now increased the level of reserves to £105,000.00. Reserves currently cover approximately the 1st quarter of expenditure, with a target for the reserves to meet the equivalent of 6 months of expenditure.

Frank Treaty joined the meeting at 12:18pm

### **Finance: Expenditure to date 2018**

2018 expenditure to date was presented to the GB for information and is near target.

The Head of Operations and Certification Standard Coordinator were asked to leave the room and returned after discussion, along with MP.

It was agreed by the GB that given the increase in the roles and responsibilities of the Head of Operation, he should be given the more appropriate title of General Manager and an increase in salary commensurate with the new role.

## **7. STRATEGY**

### **Presentation on Fishery Certification**

The Chair asked the GB for their views as to whether IFFO RS should convert the Fisheries Assessment into Fishery Certification. The Chair handed discussion to Mike Platt who gave a presentation to the GB surrounding the implications and proposal for converting Fisheries Assessment into Fishery Certification and GSSI compliance considerations ahead of discussion.

The Chair then opened the meeting to questions from the GB.

The opinion was raised that offering competition or an alternative to MSC Certification could be something good, however, in the meantime, it is important to have IFFO RS recognised in its current state, prior to moving towards offering an alternative to MSC. However, it was concluded that IFFO RS could just become another certification and it seemed unnecessary to complicate it even more, at present it needs to become established in its own right in the market. There is a chance of “mission creep” beyond reduction fisheries if IFFO RS moved towards the certification of fisheries, it would also increase the price of certification and challenge resources. IFFO RS has already succeeded in finding a niche in the market, so it makes sense to stick with the current assessment model at present.

It was agreed to keep the current situation of fishery approval for the time being.

In addition, it was suggested for IFFO RS to concentrate on looking at the data of the end product of Fish Meal and Fish Oil and strengthening the assurance of the current scope

### **Charitable Trust**

The Chair noted to the GB that if a charity is set up under UK Charity Law, which bids for funding to improve fisheries in SE Asia (specifically) and gave this to IFFO RS to then monitor this work, this would provide greater confidence from potential funder and is more likely model to be able to access funding from Foundations and Trusts as opposed to IFFO RS undertaking this role directly.

The current Chair noted he is happy to act as Trustee to the proposed charity, to which the GB posed no objections. He also asked the GB for suggestions of other suitable candidates to act as Trustees.

## **8. DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

The Governance Board agreed to the date of 12<sup>th</sup> October 2018 in London for the next meeting.

Eduardo Goycoolea left the meeting

## **9. IFFO RS STANDARD VERSION 2.0 UPDATE**

### **Social Fishery Assessment Criteria**

The Chair handed discussion to the Head of Operations who gave a presentation on the progress of the Social Fishery Assessment Criteria to the GB. Key points raised were the indicators selected in order to determine probabilities of modern slavery.

The Head of Operations asked if the GB was happy with the general approach presented, to which Libby Wodhatch provided an update on HRRTS, now renamed the Seafood Slavery Risk Tool, for the benefit of the GB, indicating that there are concerns on the robustness of the tool and the lack of granularity.

The GB agreed that the proposed approach is nothing out of the ordinary and is a classic risk assessment approach in many areas and so it is a good approach to take however, the communication in relation to any approach must be done carefully.

It was argued that any assessment should not just be at the fishery level, but also at the factory level. Mitigation of the risk of slavery should / could be conducted by the factory audit, which is what currently happens.

A discussion ensued, with many questions raised, if the CB should look at the social elements, or whether it should be independent? A pre-requisite for applicants could be to prove/disprove modern slavery. If we are looking at modern slavery, we need to look at continuous improvement and a commitment to ethical trading, and we would also require a mechanism to deal with standard holders if modern slavery was found.

Dan Lee, Michael Lutz and Jill-Denise Bohmfalk left the meeting 14:30

It was suggested that if companies are found to have problems with social elements there should be efforts for improvements such as signed commitments between the factory suppliers and the factories to ethical trading.

The Governance Board agreed that the general approach proposed needs to be strengthened and further developed, and that IFFO RS should start engagement with the ASC about the social criteria they are developing and to report any progress at the next GB meeting. **(ACTION)**.

### **MSC/IFFO RS Fishery Assessment Benchmark**

The Head of Operations provided an update on the MSC IFFO RS Fishery Assessment Benchmark to the GB and presented a summary of the results of the benchmark, briefly explaining the significance. The main area of equivalence between IFFO RS and MSC is on Principal 1 (P1), with partial equivalence at Principle 2 (P2) and Principle 3 (P3), specifically for scoring guidelines at SG60.

The question was raised with the GB as to what IFFO RS should do with the results of the report, and whether IFFO RS should proceed with further benchmarking and in-depth analysis as recommended in the report ?

The GB agreed that increasing equivalency with the MSC is not necessary however, it would be beneficial for internal use and defending the position of IFFO RS. It was noted that GSSI findings with MSC benchmark should be looked at in order to decide which areas should be focussed on, possibly with a focus on Principle 3 **(ACTION)**.

Clarus Chu requested a copy of the detailed excel file of the findings **(ACTION)**.

The GB also agreed that communication on findings will be in collaboration with MSC and IFFO RS in a joint statement and shall be passed to the GB for approval, however, concern was raised whether putting a statement out would be at all beneficial if the report was not to be made public **(ACTION)**.

It was approved by the GB that IFFO RS should develop the guidelines and interpretations for IFFO RS approved fisheries that want to continue with the MSC Certification (**ACTION**).

### **Traceability Benchmark Study**

The Head of Operations presented an update on the proposal for the formalisation of the qualification criteria that allow an IFFO RS Fishery Assessment to be waived where a fishery is already MSC certified. The aim will be to verify that a factory sources from an MSC fishery.

The GB agreed with the proposed procedure for IFFO RS recognising MSC certification. IFFO RS will instruct the Certification Body to proceed with the proposed method (**ACTION**).

The Head of Operations then presented the Traceability Benchmark Study with regards to the Chain of Custody element of traceability. The IFFO RS GB agreed with the proposal and IFFO RS is to notify MRAG to continue with the study (**ACTION**).

IFFO RS should look to protect material, which is IFFO RS approved material.

### **Standard Recognition Procedures**

The Head of Operations provided an update on the formalisation of the recognition of other standards. The intention is to formalise the recognition of MSC, GMP+/FEMAS and other possible standards that may require recognition to reduce duplication and increase efficiencies. GB members raised the question as to the potential consequences for IFFO RS of MSC and GMP combined. A final draft set of procedures and an assurance code of practice template will be presented at the next IFFO RS GB meeting in October for approval.

## **10. IFFO RS COC VERSION 2.0 UPDATE**

The update in relation to developments in the Chain of Custody Version 2 were noted by the IFFO RS GB, including notification that the trials have begun and will be ongoing through the course of 2018.

It was also agreed that during the next GB meeting in October, IFFO RS will present further developments including a ToR for public consultation and impacts assessment for approval (**ACTION**).

Concerns of adding complexity with regards to adding social and environmental aspects to the Chain of Custody standard were raised for consideration by IFFO RS.

## **11. UPDATE**

### **Certification Update**

The Head of Operations raised Duncan's concerns with regards to the failed fishery assessments under v2.0 and confirmed that Blue Whiting failed under v1.6 and not v2.0. The Certification Body will use the MSC recognition procedures in order to determine further the fate of Blue Whiting (**ACTION**).

It was agreed that the FRPC should look further into the difference between v1.6 and v2.0 of the IFFO RS standard (fishery element).

If those IFFO RS certified factories affected by the failing of the Blue Whiting fishery towards IFFO RS approval can

demonstrate that they hold an MSC certification for their specific source (ex, fishing boats are within the MSC client group), then they will be able to use that raw material as approved IFFO RS

Blake Lea-Harwood left meeting 15:50

Michiel Fransen and Duncan Leadbitter left the meeting 16:10

**CB Performance Update**

The Head of Operations provided an update on CB performance and specifically discussed the case of NSF. Following change of management, NSF have agreed to proceed with becoming IFFO RS approved CB. The IFFO RS GB took note of this update.

**Strategy Review Implementation Update**

As presented during meeting

**ISEAL Update**

The Head of Operations provided an update on the status of IFFO RS associate membership of ISEAL, which the IFFO RS Governance Board accepted together with the proposed communications strategy for noting this.

The Head of Operations also updated the board on the MEL report to be released and survey reports that have been produced.

**12. AOB**

On further business, the Chair asked if there was any further business to which there was none.

On behalf of the GB, Neils Alsted thanked Andy Jackson for his dedication and hard work in successfully establishing IFFO RS and wished him well with his retirement.

The Chair thanked members for their attendance and declared the meeting closed.

.....  
Chairman

**Board Action Log**

<b>Actions from meeting held on 23 April 2018</b>	<b>Responsible</b>	<b>Status</b>
More information to be presented at the next GB meeting regarding the possible listing on the Conservation Alliance for Seafood Solutions (CASS) website for a basic FIP, a comprehensive FIP and an IFFO RS IP FIP.	IFFO RS	Ongoing
The entry procedures for appointment of IFFO RS IP assessors to be developed and the names of potential assessors will be ready for approval at the next GB meeting with the proposed timeframe for appointment.	IFFO RS	Ongoing
2 – 5 pilot FIPs relevant to multispecies fisheries to be conducted and an update on progress of applicants requesting acceptance into the Pilot Programme is to be presented at the next GB in October 2018.	IFFO RS	Ongoing
To invite David Parker as a member of the Committees within IFFO RS such as FPRC, IPAC or TAC as an Independent consultant.	IFFO RS	Complete
To invite Tracy Cambridge to join the IFFO RS Governance Board.	IFFO RS	Complete
Feedback on the ToR and Articles of Association from GB members would be welcome. Copies can be sent to GB representative's lawyers if requested	IFFO RS GB	
IFFO RS is to start engagement with the ASC about the social criteria they are developing and to report any progress at the next GB meeting in Oct 2018.	IFFO RS	Ongoing
A further analysis of the IFFO RS/MSC benchmark is to be conducted taking into consideration GSSI.	IFFO RS	Ongoing
To send Clarus Chu a copy of the detailed excel file of the MSC and IFFO RS benchmark findings	IFFO RS	Complete
MSC and IFFO RS to produce a joint statement to communicate about the findings of the benchmark study to be passed to the GB for approval,.	IFFO RS	Ongoing
IFFO RS is to develop guidelines and interpretations for IFFO RS approved fisheries that want to continue with the MSC Certification	IFFO RS	Ongoing
IFFO RS to instruct the Certification Body to proceed with the proposed method of MSC recognition.	IFFO RS	Complete
IFFO RS to notify MRAG to proceed with the benchmark study in line with the proposal presented on the Traceability Benchmark Study with regards to the Chain of Custody element of traceability.	IFFO RS	Complete
A final draft of standard recognition procedures and an assurance code of practice template will be presented at the next IFFO RS GB meeting in October for approval.	IFFO RS	Ongoing
IFFO RS to present further developments of the CoC V2.0 including a ToR for the development of the CoC for public consultation and impacts assessment for approval during the next GB meeting in October	IFFO RS	Ongoing
The Certification Body is to use the MSC recognition procedures in order to determine further the fate of Blue Whiting	IFFO RS	Ongoing