



MarinTrust Standard V2

By-product Fishery Assessment, FRA34 *Black Scabbardfish (Aphanopus carbo), FAO 27, ICES 4a-c,6a, 7a,b,d-h,j.*

MarinTrust Programme

Unit C, Printworks

22 Amelia Street

London

SE17 3BZ

E: standards@marin-trust.com

T: +44 2039 780 819

Table 1 Application details and summary of the assessment outcome

Fishery Under Assessment	Species:	Black scabbardfish (<i>Aphanopus carbo</i>)
	Geographical area:	FAO 27 Atlantic, Northeast
	Country of origin of the product:	France
	Stock:	ICES 4a-c,6a, 7a,b,d-h,j
Date	October 2023	
Report Code	FRA34	
Assessor	Blanca Gonzalez	
Country of origin of the product - PASS	France	
Country of origin of the product - FAIL	None	

Application details and summary of the assessment outcome			
Company Name(s): Copalis industrie			
Country: France			
Email address:		Applicant Code:	
Certification Body Details			
Name of Certification Body:		LRQA	
Assessor	Peer Reviewer	Assessment Days	Initial/Surveillance/ Re-approval
Blanca Gonzalez	Jose Peiro Crespo	0.3	Surveillance 2
Assessment Period	October 2023 – October 2024		

Scope Details	
Main Species	Black scabbardfish (<i>Aphanopus carbo</i>)
Stock	ICES 4a-c,6a, 7a,b,d-h,j
Fishery Location	FAO 27 Atlantic, Northeast
Management Authority (Country/ State)	EU and UK
Gear Type(s)	Trawl and longline
Outcome of Assessment	
Peer Review Evaluation	Pass
Recommendation	Approve

Table 2. Assessment Determination

Assessment Determination
<p>Black scabbardfish (<i>Aphanopus carbo</i>) was assessed as a category D species considering that it is a Least Concern species by the IUCN, it is not included in any CITES Appendixes, and there are no reference points defined to assess the stock.</p> <p>In the Productivity-Susceptibility Analysis (PSA) black scabbardfish was awarded an average productivity score of 1.85 and an average susceptibility score of 2.5, and it didn't pass against Table D3; therefore, the species was evaluated under D4 clauses. Black scabbardfish met both D4 clauses, since the impact of the fishery is considered by ICES by providing advice based on a precautionary approach; this advice is taken into consideration, and history data demonstrates that there is no substantial evidence that the fishery has a significant negative impact on the species.</p> <p>The black scabbardfish by-product meets the Marin Trust requirements and it should remain approved for use as a raw material.</p>
Fishery Assessment Peer Review Comments
<p>The by-product fishery under assessment is the Black scabbardfish (<i>Aphanopus carbo</i>) trawl and longline fisheries in the Atlantic Northeast (FAO 27) ICES 4a-c, 6a, 7a,b,d-h,j. The species is classified as LC by the IUCN. This is a data-limited species and the stock is not managed relative to biomass reference point. Therefore, it is assessed here under category D.</p> <p>In the PSA black seabream awards an average productivity score of 1.85 and an average susceptibility score of 2.5, and it needs to be assessed under D4 clauses, which it passes.</p> <p>The peer review supports the auditor's recommendation to pass the Black scabbardfish trawl and longline fisheries in the Atlantic Northeast (FAO 27) ICES 4.a-c, 6.a,7.a,b,d-h,j (FAO area 27) under the Marin Trust IFFO RS v2.0 by-fishery standard for the production of fishmeal and fish oil.</p>
Notes for On-site Auditor
<p>There are no concerns that requires attention from the on-site assessor.</p>

Species Categorisation

NB: If any species is categorised as Endangered or Critically Endangered on the IUCN Red List, or if it appears in CITES Appendix 1, it **cannot** be approved for use as a MarinTrust raw material.

IUCN Red list Category

By-product material from a species listed by IUCN (the International Union for Conservation of Nature) under the Red List for the following categories shall immediately fail the assessment;

- EXTINCT (E) AND EXTINCT IN THE WILD (EW)
- CRITICALLY ENDANGERED (CR) facing an extremely high risk of extinction in the wild.
- ENDANGERED (EN) facing a very high risk of extinction in the wild.

By-product material may be used from the following categories provided that all clauses in the MarinTrust standard are passed.

- VULNERABLE (VU) facing a high risk of extinction in the wild.
- NEAR THREATENED (NT) does not qualify for above now, but is close or is likely to qualify for, a threatened category in the near future.
- LEAST CONCERN (LC) Widespread and abundant.
- DATA DEFICIENT (DD) and NOT EVALUATED (NE)

Table 3 Species Categorisation Table

Common name	Latin name	Stock	Management	Category	IUCN Red List Category ¹	CITES Appendix 1 ²
Black scabbardfish	<i>Aphanopus carbo</i>	ICES 4a-c,6a, 7a,b,d-h,j	No	D	Least Concern ³	No

¹ <https://www.iucnredlist.org/>

² <https://cites.org/eng/app/appendices.php>

³ <https://www.iucnredlist.org/species/18179793/42691629>

CATEGORY C SPECIES

In a by-product assessment, Category C species are those which are subject to a species-specific management regime and are usually targeted species in fisheries for human consumption.

Clause C1 should be completed for each Category C species. If there are no Category C species in the fishery under assessment, this section can be deleted. Where a species fails this Clause, it should be assessed as a Category D species instead.

Species Name		
C1	Category C Stock Status - Minimum Requirements	
	C1.1	Fishery removals of the species in the fishery under assessment are included in the stock assessment process, OR are considered by scientific authorities to be negligible.
	C1.2	The species is considered, in its most recent stock assessment, to have a biomass above the limit reference point (or proxy), OR removals by the fishery under assessment are considered by scientific authorities to be negligible.
		Clause outcome:
<p>C1.1 Fishery removals of the species in the fishery under assessment are included in the stock assessment process, OR are considered by scientific authorities to be negligible.</p> <p>C1.2 The species is considered, in its most recent stock assessment, to have a biomass above the limit reference point (or proxy), OR removals by the fishery under assessment are considered by scientific authorities to be negligible.</p>		
References		
Links		
MarinTrust Standard clause		1.3.2.2
FAO CCRF		7.5.3
GSSI		D.3.04, D5.01

CATEGORY D SPECIES

Category D species are those which are not subject to a species-specific management regime. In the case of mixed trawl fisheries, Category D species may make up the majority of landings. The comparative lack of scientific information on the status of the population of the species means that a risk-assessment style approach must be taken.

D1	Species Name	Black scabbardfish (<i>Aphanopus carbo</i>)	
	Productivity Attribute	Value	Score
	Average age at maturity (years)	3.5 ¹	1
	Average maximum age (years)	17 ¹	2
	Fecundity (eggs/spawning)	73 – 373 ²	2
	Average maximum size (cm)	151 ¹	2
	Average size at maturity (cm)	67 ¹	2
	Reproductive strategy	Broadcast spawner ¹	1
	Mean trophic level	4.5 ¹	3
	Average Productivity Score		1.85
	Susceptibility Attribute	Value	Score
	Availability (area overlap)	<10% ¹⁻³	1
	Encounterability (the position of the stock/species within the water column relative to the fishing gear)	High overlap with fishing gear ¹	3
	Selectivity of gear type	Individuals < size at maturity are frequently caught ⁴	3
	Post-capture mortality	Retained ⁴	3
	Average Susceptibility Score		2.5
	PSA Risk Rating (From Table D3)		TABLE D4
	Compliance rating		TABLE D4
	Further justification for susceptibility scoring (where relevant)		
	<i>For susceptibility attributes, please provide a brief rationale for scoring of parameters where there may be uncertainty affecting your decision</i>		
References			
1 https://www.fishbase.se/summary/Aphanopus-carbo.html			
2 Neves, A., Vieira, A. R., Farias, I., Figueiredo, I., Sequeira, V., & Gordo, L. S. (2009). Reproductive strategies in black scabbardfish (<i>Aphanopus carbo</i> Lowe, 1839) from the NE Atlantic. <i>Scientia Marina</i> , 73(S2), 19-31.			
3 https://www.fao.org/fishery/en/area/27/en			
4 ICES (2023). Working Group on the Biology and Assessment of Deep-sea Fisheries Resources (WGDEEP). ICES Scientific Reports. Report. https://doi.org/10.17895/ices.pub.22691596.v1			
<i>Standard clauses 1.3.2.2</i>			

Table D2 - Productivity / Susceptibility attributes and scores.

Productivity attributes	High productivity (Low risk, score = 1)	Medium productivity (medium risk, score = 2)	Low productivity (high risk, score = 3)
Average age at maturity	<5 years	5-15 years	>15 years
Average maximum age	<10 years	10-25 years	>25 years
Fecundity	>20,000 eggs per year	100-20,000 eggs per year	<100 eggs per year
Average maximum size	<100 cm	100-300 cm	>300 cm
Average size at maturity	<40 cm	40-200 cm	>200 cm
Reproductive strategy	Broadcast spawner	Demersal egg layer	Live bearer
Mean Trophic Level	<2.75	2.75-3.25	>3.25

Susceptibility attributes	Low susceptibility (Low risk, score = 1)	Medium susceptibility (medium risk, score = 2)	High susceptibility (high risk, score = 3)
Areal overlap (availability) Overlap of the fishing effort with the species range	<10% overlap	10-30% overlap	>30% overlap
Encounterability The position of the stock/species within the water column relative to the fishing gear, and the position of the stock/species within the habitat relative to the position of the gear	Low overlap with fishing gear (low encounterability).	Medium overlap with fishing gear.	High overlap with fishing gear (high encounterability). Default score for target species
Selectivity of gear type Potential of the gear to retain species	a Individuals < size at maturity are rarely caught	a Individuals < size at maturity are regularly caught.	a Individuals < size at maturity are frequently caught
	b Individuals < size at maturity can escape or avoid gear.	b Individuals < half the size at maturity can escape or avoid gear.	b Individuals < half the size at maturity are retained by gear.
Post-capture mortality (PCM) The chance that, if captured, a species would be released and that it would be in a condition permitting subsequent survival	Evidence of majority released post-capture and survival.	Evidence of some released post-capture and survival.	Retained species or majority dead when released.

D3		Average Susceptibility Score		
		1 - 1.75	1.76 - 2.24	2.25 - 3
Average Productivity Score	1 - 1.75	PASS	PASS	PASS
	1.76 - 2.24	PASS	PASS	TABLE D4
	2.25 - 3	PASS	TABLE D4	TABLE D4

D4 Species Name			
Impacts On Species Categorised as Vulnerable by D1-D3 - Minimum Requirements			
D4.1	The potential impacts of the fishery on this species are considered during the management process, and reasonable measures are taken to minimise these impacts.		PASS
D4.2	There is no substantial evidence that the fishery has a significant negative impact on the species.		PASS
Outcome:			PASS
<p>Evidence</p> <p>D4.1: The potential impacts of the fishery on this species are considered during the management process, and reasonable measures are taken to minimise these impacts.</p> <p>Clause is met considering that:</p> <p>Despite the fact that ICES cannot assess the stock since reference points are undefined for the black scabbardfish, advice is provided based on the precautionary approach. The advice for 2023 and 2024 is that catches should be no more than 4214 tonnes; being this slightly lower than the advice for 2021 and 2022 because of the declining stock in the northern component (ICES 2023).</p> <p>D4.2 There is no substantial evidence that the fishery has a significant negative impact on the species.</p> <p>Clause is met considering that:</p> <p>The history of ICES advice, the agreed TAC, and ICES landings data demonstrates that advice and TAC values are taken into consideration (ICES 2022) to prevent the fishery from negatively impacting the black scabbardfish stock.</p>			
<p>References</p> <p>ICES (2022). Black scabbardfish (<i>Aphanopus carbo</i>) in subareas 1, 2, 4–8, 10, and 14, and divisions 3.a, 9.a, and 12.b (Northeast Atlantic and Arctic Ocean). ICES Advice: Recurrent Advice. Report. https://doi.org/10.17895/ices.advice.19447793.v1</p>			
Links			
MarinTrust Standard clause		1.3.2.2, 4.1.4	
FAO CCRF		7.5.1	
GSSI		D.5.01	